Ancient Greek Dialects

Ancient Macedonian: A case study

Ancient Greek Language

It is very important to emphasize that what we call “Ancient Greek”, classical Greek included, was not a common Greek language but a number of dialect groups (διάλεκτοι) and local dialects (ιδιώματα) of the Greek language, broadly or locally spoken and used as official languages for each City-State. Texts from the 15th cent. B.C. till the last quarter of the 4th cent. B.C. allover Greece show that only dialects (Greek dialects of course, but not common Greek) were spoken and written in Greece, till Alexander the Great. What is unique and worth to be mentioned is that even literature (tragedies, comedies, poetry, prose) was written and performed in dialects, which differed according to the type of literature. There were used, so to say, “literary dialects". The dialectal differentiation of Greek was mainly due to the political system of City-State (each City-State used its own dialect in official documents) and was due also to practical difficulties in communication because of the geographical structure of Greece.

The Greeks used four (4) major dialects to speak and write Greek: Attic, Ionic, Achaean and Doric. It was only in the last quarter of the 4th century B.C. that a common Greek language was established, the so-called Alexandrian Koine, based on Attic dialect, with elements of Ionic dialect, and some specific lexical items from Achaean and Doric dialects (like Doric λοχαγός, Achaean βροτός, Achaean ὄνυμα instead of ὅνομα in words like συνώνυμος, ἐπώνυμος etc.).
Alexandrian Koine was used till the 4th or —according to others— till the 6th century A.D. Then, the so-called Atticistic Greek, an imitation of classical Attic Greek, actually a scholar language, formed and used since the 1st cent. B.C. was established in written speech and was upgraded to official language by the Byzantine emperor Justinian[527-265]. Common people, of course, continued speaking a more simple form of Greek, the development of Greek Koine, which was to constitute later the so-called δημοτική γλώσσα.

One of the ancient Greek dialects spoken in Northern Greece, in Macedonia, was Macedonian Greek, a Greek dialect belonging —as I argue— to the Doric dialects or, according to other scholars, being a part of Achaean dialects group.

**Macedonian Greek**

**General**

For reasons which will be explained, oral —I emphasize oral— Macedonian Greek is known to us through restricted written evidence: only 350 words (100 common nouns and 250 proper nouns). No texts. The crucial question is why? The answer is that Macedonian dialect has never been used as official written language of Macedonian State. That simple! Macedonian dialect was used only as oral language and, mutatis mutandis, could be compared to the dialects used today in Greece (what people speak, for instance, in Crete or in Mani or in Trikala or in Corfu or in Tsakonia or in Siatista): that is to say, dialects which are spoken but not written, esp. in official documents.

Because of this fact, Macedonian Greek has been preserved only through evidence coming from scholars (lexicographers,
grammarians, annotators), esp. by scholars concerned with “linguistic curiosities” (what the Greeks called «γλῶσσαι»), i.e. dialectal words or grammatical forms, deviating from official dialects, esp. from Attic Greek.

It is important to clarify, however, that what we miss is **oral dialect evidence**, not evidence of the official state language, of documents (inscriptions, decrees, texts etc.). There are thousands of such documents of **the official written Macedonian Greek**, which was the classical Attic dialect. It was this dialect which was early established as official language of Macedonian State by the king Philipp, Alexander’s father. That happened, of course, due to the high political and cultural prestige that Attic dialect had among ancient Greek dialects and, mainly, due to the political aspirations inside and outside Greece that king Philipp had.

**On the Greekness of Ancient Macedonian**

• Everybody, familiar with Greek language, will easily recognize as Greek ancient Macedonian words like:

-1-

Common nouns

- **ἀγκαλίς**”ἀχθος. καίδρέπανονΜακεδόνες” [Ἡσύχ.] ("sickle" from its resemblance with the form of embrace [ἀγκάλη])
- **ἀγχαρμον** «ἀνωφερῆτὴναἰχμήν, κἄγχαρμον·τὸτὴνλόγχηνἄνωἔχειν» [Ἡσύχ.] (<ἀναχάρμαν<ἀνωχάρμην “pick up the lance”)
- **ἀκρουνοί** «ὁροιύπόΜακεδόνων» [Ἡσύχ.] (<ἀκρα “boundaries”)
ἀμαλή «ἀμαλήτικαλή. ἠδελέξιςΜακεδόνων» [Μέγα Ετυμ.] (“soft”)

ἀργελλά «οἰκημαΜακεδονικόν, ὑπεθερμαίνοντεςλούονται» [Σούδα] (“a construction made of [ἀργυλλος] clay”)

ἀργίτος «ἀετός: Μακεδόνες» [Ησύχ.] (“swift-footed, eagle”)

ἀρκόν «σχολήν. Μακεδόνες» [Ησύχ.] (= ἀργός inactive)

κάρβας «ὑπὸΜακεδόνων ἡ πύλη» [Ησύχ.] (“gate”)

κεβαλά [Μέγα Ετυμ.] (“head”)

κοράσιον [Σχολιαστής Ομήρου]
«εἰδέθεποιτοτῆειςἀπαράδωσεισιδιατουρπριμάσιοι, κορυφάσιοι. Οὔτως ἔχει καὶ τὸ κοράσιον, οὕτως ἑστι ἑστι Μακεδονικόν” (“girl”)

νικάτωρ [Πολύβιος—Titus Livius “cohorsregia, quos Nicatores appellant (Macedones)” — Ἡσύχ.
«νικάτορες οἰκιμαῖοτατοιεντατάξεις» — Σέλευκος Α’ Νικάτωρ] (“victorious, unconquerable, invincible’)

παράσος «ἀετός: Μακεδόνες» [Ησύχ.] (<παρώος /παρωός “grey-red” color for eagle)

πέλιος [Στράβων]
«ὀτικατὰΘεσπρωτοὺς καὶ Μολοττοὺς τὰς γραιαὶς πελίας καὶ τοὺς γέροντας πελίους ὀνομάζουσιν, καθάπερ καπηλαῆ, Μακεδόνοι» (“ old man, ambassador, deputy”)

πεζαίτερος (“infantry-men”)  

χάρων «ὁ λέων κατὰ Μακεδόνας» [Σχολ. Δυκόφρ.] (“lion”)

Propernames
Ἀγάθων, Ἀέροπος, Ἀισχρίων, Ἀλέξανδρος, Ἀλέξαρχος, Ἀλκέτας, Ἀλκίμαχος, Αμύντας, Αμφοτερός, Αντίγονος, Αντιγόνη, Αντίπατρος, Αργαῖος, Αρριδαῖος, Ἀταλάντη, Ἀττάλος, Βερενίκη, Γοργίας, Γυναία, Δάμων, Δημήτριος, Ἑλλάνικος, Εὐρυδίκη, Εὐρωπῆ, Εὐρύνόη, Ἐφασίων, Ἐφασίως, Ἐφασίος, Ἐφασίστις, Ἐφασίστιος, Πάνταλέως, Παυσανίας, Παυσανίδας, Περδίκκας, Πολυπέρχων, Πτολεμαίος, Σέλευκος, Στρατωνίκη, Σωσθένης, Φίλιππος, Φίλων, Φιλωτας, Χαρικλῆς

• It is remarkable that in the linguistic feeling, the experience, the knowledge and the awareness of Ancient Greeks all over Greece, especially those concerned with the language, Macedonian dialect was considered and frequently referred to as one of the Greek dialects, spoken by the Greeks.

Hesychios, a Greek lexicographer of the 5th cent. A.D., has collected the so-called γλῶσσαι (“queer”, rare, or unknown in meaning or deviating grammatical forms from Greek dialects) and comments on them. Examples:

- 2 -

ἀκόντιον∙δοράτιον, μικράλόγχη Μακεδόνες (“small glance”)
ἀσπιλος∙χείμαρος ὑπὸ Μακεδόνων. (“torrent – goat”)
γώπας∙κολοιοὺς∙Μακεδόνες. ("magpie" [a kind of bird])

Ζευρήνη∙ΑφροδίτηνΜακεδονία.

κάραβος∙'ἐδεσμα, ἄφασιν, ὲπημένονη· ἀνθράκων·

καίταέντοιξηροιξύλοιςκωλήκια·

καίτοθαλάττιονζώων.

(“shrimp – gate”)

ματτύης∙'ἡμένωνήΜακεδονηκή.

ὁρνίς·καίταέκτοξωµουαύτονλάχαναπεριφερόμενα. [Αθήναιος:

«ματτύηνωνόµαζονπάντοπολυτελέζηςἐδεσμα […] εἰτείχθυσείη, εἰτεδόνις, εἰτελάχανον, εἰτείερείον, εἰτεπεµµάτιον»] (”gourmet food”)

Ξανδικά·'ἐορτήΜακεδόνων, Ξανδικουµηνόζαγοµένη

(Macedonean feast to honor AppolloXanthos) [Σούδα

«ἐναγίζων·ἐναγίζουσινοὖντῶΞάνθῳΜακεδόνεςκαίκαθαρµόνο

οιούσιντοιξύπποιξώπλισµένοις»]

•Macedonian is only one among Greek dialects, from which

Hesychios collects his γλῶσσαι, with no special distinction or
differentiation from the other dialects. Examples:

- 3 -

ἀβαγνα·φόδαΜακεδόνες

ἀβάθων·διδάσκαλοςΚύπριοι

ἀβελιακόν·νυμφαῖςΠαμφύλοι

ἀβρανίδας·κροκωτοῦςΛάκων

ἀβραπής·ἄβλεπῆςΚύπριοικαὶΘετταλοῖ

ἀβρούτες·ὀφρύςΜακεδόνες
According to Herodotus, the renowned Greek historian, “the father of history” (5th century B.C.), the Greek Dorians lived in the region of Mountain Pindos, originally named “Macedonians”, and it was only later that they came to Peloponnese:

"Τὁ Δωρικὸν οἶκε ἐν Πίνδῳ, Μακεδόνκελεόμενον ἐνθεῦτεν ἐς Πελοπόννησον ἐλθὸν Δωρικὸν ἐκλήθη".

(Herod. I,56)

The same historian states that the Spartans and Corinthians as well as the citizens of Sicyon, Epidaurus and Troizen were a Dorian and Macedonian «ἔθνος»

"Ἐόντες οὗτοι [sc. Λακεδαιμόνιοι, Κορίνθιοι, Σικυώνιοι, Ἐπιδαύριοι, Τριζήνιοι] Δωρικόντεκαι Μακεδόνεθνος, ἐξ Ερινεοῦτεκαὶ Πινδουκαίτης Δρυοπίδοσταταόρμηθέντες».

(Herod. VIII, 43)

More characteristic is the epigram about a girl named Κοπρία:
She apologizes that her name is ill-sounding (it comes from the word κόπρος which means “dung”, “manure”) but she explains that it is a name used by Macedonians (Μακέται as well as Μακεδνοί are parallel ancient forms for Μακεδόνες). Therefore she asks that nobody blames her for it; after all, it were her parents who gave her that name!

• In the well-known etymological dictionary of 12th century A.D. under the title Μέγα Ἑτυμολογικόν (Etymologicum Magnum) the unknown lexicographer (rather a compiler of ancient information) refers to the etymology of the goddess name Ἀφροδίτη (Venus). He argues that Ἀφροδίτη comes from Ἀβροδίαιτη “delicately feeded”. What is worth to notice here is that the grammarian spontaneously uses Macedonian dialect to explain phonetically the name of Ἀφροδίτη. He argues that the name derives from Ἀβροδίαιτη, and in order to justify the presence of -β- instead of -φ- that occurs in Ἀφροδίτη, he calls to Macedonian in which β occurs instead of φ. I quote:

-7-

«Οδὲ Δίδυμος παρὰ τὸ ἁβρὸν τῆς διαίτης τοβτώφυσυγγενέστερον ἔτσι. δήλον Νέκτωρ Μακεδόνας μεμνημέντον Φίλιππον Βιλιππον καλεῖ καὶ τὸν Φάλακρον βαλακρόν. καίτοις Φρύγας Βρύγας καιτούς ζανέμος διατοφύσανθετας βύκτας.»
• Another grammarian derives etymologically the noun κεφαλή from the verb κυφω / κυφούσθαι, based on a word used by Hippocrates for “head”, again with β instead of φ, the word κυβητος and the corresponding word κεβλήν of Macedonian. Once again he explains that β stands for φ in this dialect:

- 8 -

«κεφαλή: ἀπότοικεκυφώσθαι, ἤγουνκεκάμφθαι [...]καὶΠτοκράτηςκύβητον, Μακεδόνεςδέκεβλήν, τοβαντίτοφλαμβάνοντεςώζεπιΒερενίκης Φερενίκηγάρἐστιν».

(Anecd. Oxon. [Cramer] II, 456, 27)


• Most important is the fact that the famous grammarian Apollonius, 2nd cent. AD, the author of «Περίσσυντάξεως» (whose nickname was «δύσκολος»), in his explanation of the formation of homeric nouns ending in -ᾱinstead of -ης (νεφεληγερέτᾱ instead of νεφεληγερέτης, ἵπποτᾱ instead of ἵπποτης etc.) he argues that this noun formation comes either from Macedonian or from Thessalian dialect. This means that the famous grammarian felt that Macedonian was a very old Greek dialect, which could be used to explain even some peculiar homeric forms:
-9-

«ἡκλητικὴἀντ
eυθείωνπαραλαμβάνεταικατὰΜακεδονικὸνήθεσσαλικὸνἐθνὸς
, ὡς καὶ προδήμων τοῦτον ἐπιστῶσαντο». 


[Cf. Eustath., ad Hom. γ 68, p. 1457, 18 «καὶ περίτοιο ἵππος ὥς ὡςοἱ πρὸ ἡμῶν τὸ τοιούτον ἐπιστῶσαν
καὶ περὶ τοῦ ἵπποτά, ποιητικῆς ταύτης ἐυθείας τῶν ἑνικῶν,
ἥν καὶ ὧσας κατ᾽ αὐτὴν, ὅπηλά, ὁ ἱππηλάται καὶ τὰς ὧσὰς ὧσας
Εὐδαίμων ὁ Πηλουσιώτης Μακεδόνων γλώσσης ἐλέγει»]

Against the genuine character of Ancient Macedonian

Two main linguistic arguments were used in the past against the genuine Greek character of Ancient Macedonian:

(i) The occurrence of the sounds β, γ, δ instead of φ, θ, χ:

-10-

Βιλιππος instead of Φιλιππος
Βεθενίκη instead of Φεθενίκη
κεβαλά instead of κεφαλά

(ii) The great number of loan words in Macedonian.

In terms of these two linguistic data it has been argued in the past by a very small number of linguists that Macedonian was a
separate “mixed language”, a mixture of Greek with Illyrian and Thracian.

(i) Regarding the first argument, the consonants written with βδγ were not pronounced as b d g (voiced stops) but as v (voiced spirants or fricatives), just like the way they are pronounced in Modern Greek, going back to 3rd cent. B.C. This means that this phonological pattern anticipated what was later generalized in all Greek. The change was enabled by the fact that v could easily interchange with the phonetically similar sounds f θ χ (they were both fricatives), to which they had very early changed the originally phthkh consonants of Macedoniandialect (the so-called aspirate stops changed to non-aspirate fricatives).

This means that in Ancient Macedonian Greek there has taken place very early a phonological development (named spirantisation or devoicing) which was generalized later in Greek, being the most prolific characteristic of Greek consonantism in the transition from Ancient Greek to Koine Greek and to Modern Greek. This has been my theoretical explanation of the issue, published in a paper under the title “Mediae question in Ancient Macedonian Greek reconsidered”, (Essays in Linguistics offered in Honor of Oswald Szemerenyi, 1991), an explanation which has been almost generally accepted for the phonological structure of Ancient Macedonian.

Thus, far from being a non-Greek feature, this phonological development (βδγ to be pronounced as v and φθχ as f θ χ) proves to be an early systemic tendency of Greek towards a more symmetrical consonantal system,
which came to be the overall characteristic of the phonological system of Greek since the time of Koine Greek. This change was so early achieved in Macedonian dialect, because—as we said—it was only orally used and major changes were not “blocked” by the conventional and conservative character of written language.

(ii) As to the second argument, regarding the loan-words from neighboring languages (Illyrian and Thracian), there is no reason to deny it as this is a frequent and common fact among neighboring peoples, especially at that region and in that time. This is a usual case which in no way consists an argument for “a mixed language” or for “a distortion” of the character of Greek language.

Ancient Macedonian dialect: Achaean or Doric?

There has been a long discussion among linguists as to which dialectal group of Ancient Greek Macedonian dialect belongs to. There have been three views:

(i) The aeolean (achaean) view. It was mainly argued by the German linguist Otto Hoffmannn (Die Makedonen. IhreSprache und ihrVolkstum.1906 [1974]), the one who first proved convincingly that Ancient Macedonian is pure Greek. According to this view, Macedonian shares more linguistic features to be found in Northern Achaean, the so-called Aeolian group, to which there belong also ancient Thessalian, Beotian and Lesbian dialects.

(ii) The doric view. This view was mainly argued by IoannisKalleris (Les anciensMacedoniens. Etude linguistique
et historique, 2 volumes I [1954], II[1974]). According to it, Ancient Macedonian dialect should be classified within the group of Doric or the Northwestern group, together with Epirotic, Phocian (Delphic), Locrian and Elian.

(iii) The mixed or “Aeolodorian” view. That was actually the view of the famous Greek linguist George Chadzidakis. According to him Ancient Macedonian (together with Pamphylian dialect in Minor Asia) could make up a dialectal group within Northwestern (that is within Doric group), as a kind of “a sub-group”.

On the basis of new linguistic arguments I have argued since 1988 on the occasion of the 1st International Congress Of Macedonian Studies, organized at La Trobe University by Prof. Anastasios Tamis, that “The Macedonian dialect, although it is presented with certain elements which are considered Achaean, has crucial Doric characteristics or, more precisely, belongs to the northwestern Greek dialects. The arguments in favor of this position are primarily based on the phonological and lesson the grammatical structure of the Macedonian dialect and constitute, in my opinion, strong evidence regarding the Doric character of this dialect.” Let me mention, by the way, that in a very recent book of 2012, published in Greece by the Centre for Greek Language, entitled “Ancient Macedonia: Language, History, Culture”, Professor Julian Mendez Dosuna (University of Barcelona) has come to the same result, after having considered all aspects of research conducted on the Ancient Macedonian dialect.

(i)Phonological level. What I have proved is that a number of characteristic features of the Achean dialects, which would lead to classify Ancient Macedonian to the Achean or Aeolic dialects group, are not found in Macedonian:
Maced. δράμις “a kind of bread”, but Achean *δρόμις
Maced. δάρυλλος “oak”, but Achean *δόρυλλος
Maced. κο(μ)μάραι “shrimps”, but Achean *κομμώραι
Maced. Κράτερος (proper name), but Achean *Κρότερος
Maced. ζέρεθρον (<δέρεθρον) “abyss”, but Achean βέρεθρον
Maced. αἰδῶσσα “hall”, but Achean αἴθοισα, Att. αἰθοῦσα

(ii) Grammatical level. In contrast, on grammatical level a number of characteristics of Macedonian are to be found mainly in Doric dialects:

- 12 -

κεβαλά, λακεδάμα – ψευδάνωρ, κοράσιον, νικάτωρ

(τοῦ) Παυσανία, Αμύντα, Περδίκκα (genitive)

(τῶν) πελιγᾶν (=πελιγῶν) (genitive plural)

ήμεροδόριμας (=ήμεροδρόμος), βοικεφάλας (=βουκέφαλος) (-acformationinsteadof-ος)

(iii) Lexical level. Regarding the lexical level (the words of Macedonian dialect) Kalleris argues: “It is enough to take a look at […] the number of words found in each one of these [Macedonian and Doric] to realize that most of these words are common to Macedonian and to the Doric dialects in the broader sense (i.e. the main Doric and the northwestern), while few of them are common to Macedonian and the Aeolian dialects. This is something which allows us to come to the conclusion that Macedonian was closely related to the dialects of the first group (the Doric), but it also presents certain similarities to the Aeolian dialects”
Conclusion. On all levels (phonological, grammatical and lexical) common structural features of Macedonian and Doric lead us to classify Macedonian within the Doric, esp. the Northwestern group of Doric dialects.

The linguistic truth for the pseudonymous “Macedonian language” of the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (FYROM)

I call to your attention now. Listen to this:

- 13 -

Da vi go pretstavamsina mi Blazeta...Mu jadadornaPetratak nigata...
...Go razbivaliperacot

Does anybody who knows Greek, would recognize these phrases as Greek or as having anything to do with Macedonian Greek spoken in Macedonia, in Northern Greece for centuries? Would anyone identify this language with Macedonian Greek? Yet this token of language is precisely the one which is called “Macedonian language” by FYROM since 1944, since the time when this district — which was known till 1944 as “VardaskaBanovina” (“administrative region of the river Vardar”) — was renamed by Tito to “Macedonia”. And it is this recent (Former Yugoslavian) State with the pseudonymous name “Macedonia”, which calls their Slavic language “Macedonian language”, causing a confusion with the traditional, historic Greek Macedonian language. Both the name of FYROM as “Macedonia” and the name of their language as “Macedonian” cause intentionally this confusion. Yet, it is evident that only a completely distinctive name like Skopjaor even a composite name like “Slavomacedonia” or “Vardarmacedonia” or what else would be suitable to denote the identity of this recent
entity, by avoiding in practice the identification of FYROM with the historically established name of Greek Macedonia. That FYROM, however, insists on the name “Macedonia” is a provocation and a clear intention to confuse the name of Greek Macedonia with the name of FYROM as “Macedonia”, a fact that can only serve political aspirations.

What about the “Macedonian language” of FYROM? Does it have any relation to ancient or modern Macedonian Greek? As you heard from the sample that I read for you, it has nothing to do with the language spoken in Greek Macedonia. The language spoken in FYROM is a mixture of Slavic language, a Bulgarian-Serbian mixture. The real name of FYROM’s language—coming from its origin and its structure—would be bulgaroserbian or Serbobulgarian or Neoslavicor Slavic of Skopia. It was Bulgarian which was spoken at this area, before this geographical region came to consist a part of Yugoslav Federation, governed by Tito. And it was the Bulgarians who always claimed that this territory belongs to them and who blamed FYROM’s government constructing an artificial Serbian language by substituting Bulgarian words and structural elements with Serbian, so that this language does not look like Bulgarian. And it was the Bulgarians who used to call this artificial language “kolisefskian Serbian” (after the name of the first prime-minister of Skopia, of Lazar Kolisefki).

All these agree with what great linguists teach about the Slavic language of FYROM. Vitore Pisani, one of the most famous Italian linguists, has written that “In reality the term ‘Macedonian language’ is a product of political origin”. Also the French Slavologist Andre Vaillant clarifies that “the name Bugari is in reality the national name of the Slavs of ‘Macedonia’ [he means FYROM], which indicates that the Slavs of this region accepted the name that the Serbians gave to them”. He also argues that the Slavic spoken in Skopia goes back to
Old Slavic and belongs to the Bulgarian dialects. Finally, **Heinz Wendt**, a German linguist, referring to Slavic languages, says “Bulgarian and Macedonian, due to their outstanding structural particularities, should be considered as a separate Slavic group and be distinguished from all other Slavic languages”.

**Conclusion**

From what has been said two things are evident, I hope:

(i) Ancient Macedonian dialect, which was spoken in Greek Macedonia was a pure Greek dialect used for oral communication, a Greek dialect classified within the Doric, esp. the Northwestern group of Greek dialects. It was early replaced in written and oral use with Attic for political reasons. This Greek dialect has been continuously used in Greek Macedonia from ancient years till today. This has always been known all over the world as the Macedonian language.

It was only since 1944 that the Bulgaroserbian Slavic of FYROM started to be used with the fictitious name “Macedonian language”, a name which has created the confusion described before. And it has been a great mistake of the Greeks (concerned at that time with the German Occupation and the Civil War) that they did not react drastically, they did not protest in international fora for this obvious forgery of historical truth. They assessed that this action of former Yugoslavia was impossible to be successful.

(ii) Equally disorienting is the fictitious name of FYROM as “Macedonia”, based on a geographical definition of this
new Yugoslav state, which intentionally —for political reasons— used a national name causing confusion with the preexisting for more than 25 centuries name of Greek Macedonia. The fact that the political leaders of FYROM constantly refer to king Philipp and to Alexander the Great as their predecessors ( ! ) convinces that it is not a mere historical misinterpretation but astriking caseof “stolen history”.